CCC Core Indicators of Institutional Effectiveness
Summary of Indicator Status After One Year

Indicator status: 8 indicators up, 5 indicators flat, 4 indicators down

Value: Community
1. Responsiveness to Community Needs
2. Diversity
3. Economic Growth
4. Enrollment Growth

Value: Ethics
5. Financial Audits
6. Faculty Credentials

Value: Learning and Growth
7. Course Completions
8. Learning Outcomes
9. Curriculum
10. Student Support Services

Value: Quality
11. Student Goal Attainment
12. Retention
13. Licensure and Certification Pass Rates
14. Transfer Rates

Value: Respect
15. Valuing Employees and Promoting a Learning Environment

Value: Sustainability
16. Sustainability Commitment
17. Sustainable Purchasing Practices
Core Indicators of Effectiveness for
Coconino Community College
Adopted by College Council August 12, 2009
With First Year Update Measures

Value: Community

1. **Responsiveness to Community Needs:**
   1) Number of non-credit workshops and courses offered to meet adult learning,
   2) Number of community based events hosted or participated in by CCC,
   3) The number of credit and non-credit offerings taught in Coconino County outside Flagstaff and Page,
   and 4) CCC tuition and fees in relation to Arizona and the national community college average.

   1) **Baseline:** 89 workshop/course sections delivered in 2008
   **1st Year Update:** 95 workshop/course sections delivered in 2009
   **Measure:** Number of non-credit workshops delivered District-wide annually as recorded on Banner.

   2) **Baseline:** 42 College events (2008)
   **1st Year Update:** 40 College events (2009)
   **Measure:** Number of community based events listed on the Events Calendar

   3) **Baseline:** 35 credit course sections and 6 non-credit course sections (2008-09)
   **1st Year Update:** 48 credit course sections and 2 non-credit course sections (2009-10)
   **Measure:** Number of course sections taught by any delivery mode to Fredonia, Grand Canyon, Tuba City and Williams, as recorded on Banner, in one fiscal year.

   4) **Baseline:** $1,970 for CCC compared to $1,691, or 116% of the State average, and $2,402, or 82% of the national average (2008-09)
   **1st Year Update:** $2,250 for CCC compared to $1,817, or 124% of the State average, and $2,544, or 88% of the national average of (2009-10)
   **Measure:** Academic year cost tuition and mandatory fees (excluding class fees) for enrolling at 30 hours, Arizona Community College Chief Business Officers and Trends in College Pricing, The College Board

2. **Diversity:**
   1) Demographic breakout of employees and student body compared to the adult demographics of Coconino County,
   2) Level of overall satisfaction with CCC among ethnic minority employees and students,
   and 3) The Extent that CCC ethnic minority employees and students agree that a). CCC is a place that appreciates and celebrates human diversity and b). Maintains a climate inclusive of people from different backgrounds.
1) **Baseline:**

*Employees (2008-2009)*
- FT Faculty: 7% ethnic minority, 50% female
- FT Exec/Adm/Managerial: 25% ethnic minority, 50% female
- FT Professional: 20% ethnic minority, 59% female

Total FT: 15% ethnic minority, 59% female
Total PT: 10% ethnic minority, 50% female

**1st Year Update: (2009-2010)**
- FT Faculty: 11% ethnic minority, 48% female
- FT Exec/Adm/Managerial: 17% ethnic minority, 44% female
- FT Professional: 25% ethnic minority, 57% female

Total FT: 19% ethnic minority, 58% female
Total PT: 14% ethnic minority, 56% female

*Student*
- (2008-09) 36% ethnic minority, 53% female
- (2009-10) 34% ethnic minority, 57% female

*Coconino County*
- Adults 20 years or older (2009): 31% ethnic minority, 51% female

**Measure:** CCC IPEDS Human Resource Survey and Fall Enrollment Survey, *Population estimates, U.S. Census*

**Baseline: (2008-2009)**
All Employees [place holder until minority employee responses can be collected]
- 77% favorable overall satisfaction
- 65% favorable concerning diversity
- 72% favorable concerning inclusiveness

Minority Students–
- 93% overall satisfaction
- 64% report high gains multi-cultural awareness education
- 83% favorable “Understanding diversity in the global arena”
- 71% favorable “Faculty used examples of diversity in class material”

**1st Year Update: (2009-2010)**
Minority Employees
- 74% overall satisfaction
- 85% favorable concerning diversity
- 70% favorable concerning inclusiveness
Minority Students
95% overall satisfaction
85% favorable concerning diversity
87% favorable concerning inclusiveness
80% report high gains in multi-cultural awareness
78% favorable “Faculty used examples of diversity in class material”

**Measure:** Proportion of employees who report being a member of an ethnic minority group who respond favorably to the statements “Overall, I like working for Coconino Community College” “CCC is a place that appreciates and celebrates human diversity”, and “CCC maintains a climate inclusive of people from different backgrounds” on the Employee Satisfaction Survey.

Proportion of students who report being a member of an ethnic minority group agreeing with the statements “Overall, I am satisfied with the education I received at CCC,” “CCC is a place that appreciates and celebrates human diversity,” “CCC maintains a climate inclusive of people from different backgrounds,” “The education I received at CCC helped me understand how diversity issues are interrelated in regional, national, and global relations,” and “The faculty at CCC used examples of diversity (different cultures, religions, races, people with disabilities, etc.) in their class material” on the Graduating Student Survey.

3. **Economic Growth:** 1) CCC contribution to annual economic growth of Coconino County, 2) Proportion of occupations critical to the economy and health of Coconino County comprised by CCC graduates, and 3) Total increased CCC graduate income productivity.

1) **Baseline:** $80 million total income generated (Fiscal Year 2007)
**1st Year Update:** $85 million total income generated (Fiscal Year 2008)
**Measure:** Total CCC and CCC Foundation expenses, special events and visitor expenses, student aid minus collected tuition and fees, student expenses minus tuition and fees, an further spending by county based businesses and individuals based on CCC income over a fiscal year.

2) **Baseline:** 16% of registered nurses, 14% of paramedics, 25% of firefighters and 25% of detention officers (as of 2007 graduating class)
**1st Year Update:** 11% of registered nurses, 11% of paramedics, 51% of firefighters and 43% of detention officers (as of 2009 graduating class)
**Measure:** The number CCC graduates divided into number of occupational positions in Coconino County

3) **Baseline:** $66 million additional income productivity (All graduates through 2006)
**1st Year Update:** $122 million additional income productivity (All graduates through 2009)
**Measure:** Average annual income of CCC Adult Basic Education, certificate and associate’s degree graduates (as reported by the AZ Dept. of Economic Security on actual CCC graduates) minus average base income prior to graduation multiplied by the number of years since CCC graduation.
4. **Enrollment Growth**: 1) Proportion of recent high school graduates in Coconino County who subsequently enroll at CCC and 2) Proportion of student headcount and FTSE growth as compared to the previous year.

1) **Baseline**: 11.7% CCC county capture rate compared to 22.3% for Arizona community colleges (2008)
   
   **1st Year Update**: 12.3% CCC county capture rate compared to 25.0% for Arizona community colleges (2009)
   
   **Measure**: AZ Dept of Ed high school enrollment by county report and Arizona community college high school performance reports

2) **Baseline**: Summer ’08 FTSE up 2.2%, Fall ’08 FTSE up 2.7%, Spring ’09 FTSE up 11.6%, annual growth 10%
   
   **1st Year Update**: Summer ’09 FTSE up 15.8%, Fall ’09 FTSE up 15.4%, Spring ’10 FTSE up 7.7%, annual growth 11.9%
   
   **Measure**: Official FSTE counts

Value: Ethics

5. **Financial Audits**: 1) CCC maintains high grade long term bond rating, and 2) CCC receives an unqualified opinion report from external auditors annually.

1) **Baseline**: AA-/Stable long term bond rating
   
   **1st Year Update**: AA-/Stable long term bond rating
   
   **Measure**: Current Standard and Poor's bond credit rating

2) **Baseline**: Independent Auditors’ Report for Fiscal Year 2007-08 from the State of Arizona Auditor General found financial statements to be presented fairly and free of material misstatement.
   
   **1st Year Update**: Independent Auditors’ Report for Fiscal Year 2008-09 from the State of Arizona Auditor General found financial statements to be presented fairly.
   
   **Measure**: Independent Auditors’ Report

6. **Faculty Credentials**: Educational level and experience of faculty meets or exceeds the level set by CCC standards.

   **Baseline**: (2009-10)
   
   - Doctorate: 7%
   - Master’s: 42%
   - Bachelor’s: 20%
   - Associate’s: 2%
   - Certificate: 3%
   - High School: 5%
   - Unknown: 22%

Average 6 years teaching at CCC and 1.2 years college level elsewhere

   **Measure**: Personnel file records and hire dates entered into Banner.
Value: Learning & Growth

7. **Course Completions**: Proportion of learners who: 1) earned a “C” or better in credit courses, 2) pass a final exam or earn a certificate of completion in corporate course, and 3) successful Small Business Development Center course clients.

   **Baseline:**
   1) 89% of 16,673 performance grades posted credit learners
   2) 100% of 51 corporate learners
   3) 100% of 106 SBDC clients
   (2008-09)

   **1st Year Update:**
   1) 83% of 18,373 grades posted on credit learners
   2) 100% 813 corporate learners
   3) 100% of 115 SBDC clients
   (2009-10)

   **Measure:** Standing of the learner’s level of achievement at the end of the course or workshop.

8. **Departmental/Major Learning Outcomes**: Proportion of CCC academic departments using best practices to measure student achievement in meeting departmental/major outcomes.

   **Baseline:**
   Eleven of 17 academic disciplines (64%) using best practices, 3 under development (18%), 3 needs progress (18%) (2008)

   **1st Year Update:**
   Thirteen of 17 academic disciplines (76%) using best practices, 4 under development (36%) (2009)

   **Measurement:** Review of academic department annual assessment template updates

9. **Curriculum**: 1) Currency of curriculum is evaluated on a regular basis, 2) Coherency of the curriculum to outcomes is evaluated on a regular basis, and 3) Conduct formal program reviews on all academic programs on a regular rotating schedule.

   1) **Baseline:** 193 courses, of 731 total courses, approved for modification or retired by the Curriculum Committee. Twenty-six percent of the curriculum up-dated (2008-09).

   **1st Year Update:** 41, courses, of 611 total courses, approved for modification or retired by the Curriculum Committee. Seven percent of the curriculum updated (2009-10).

   **Measure:** Curriculum Committee approval records.

   2) **Baseline:** Courses for majors reviewed and mapped to program outcomes in 2008. Courses for general education reviewed and mapped to general education outcomes in 2009.

   **Measure:** Course reviews and mapping completed on a five-year cycle.

   3) **Baseline:** Program reviews for Developmental Math and CISCO slated for fall 2009.

   **1st Year Update:** Scheduled Program reviews completed

   **Measure:** Completion of at least two academic program reviews each year.
10. **Student Support Services**: Promote learning success by providing a high level satisfaction in the services determined to be important by the learner.

**Baseline and 1st year update:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Satisfaction Level</th>
<th>2008-09</th>
<th>2009-10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very Satisfied</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very Satisfied</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat Dissatisfied</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very Dissatisfied</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Measure**: Ratings for library, computer lab, Help Desk, LEC, Advising, Security, classroom equipment, and Financial Aid from the Graduating Student Survey (responses for those not using the service are excluded)

**Value**: Quality

11. **Student Goal Attainment**: Proportion of students who report their CCC experience met their individually defined educational goal.

**Baseline**: 82% of credit, non-credit and adult basic education students (2008-09)

**1st Year Update**: 80% of credit, non-credit and adult basic education students (2000-10)

**Measure**: Course evaluations

12. **Retention**: Proportion of full-time, first time students who enrolled at the beginning of the fall semester and who (1) were still enrolled for at least one credit at the beginning of the next academic year and who (2) had not yet completed a degree or certificate compared to the proportion found at all Arizona community colleges.

**Baseline**: 49% retention rate for CCC compared to 55% for Arizona community colleges (2007)

**1st Year Update**: 45% retention rate for CCC compared to 55% for Arizona community colleges (2008)

**Measure**: IPEDS Enrollment Survey

13. **Licensure and Certification Pass Rates**: Proportion of career program completers who seek and obtain their license/certification within one year from graduation on their first attempt compared to state/national takers of these same tests.

**Baseline**: 83% of CCC test takers were successful on first attempt compared to 80% of test takers in general (2009)

**1st Year Update**: 90% of CCC test takers were successful on first attempt compared to 80% of test takers in general (2010)

**Measure**: License/certification in nursing, emergency medical technician and fire fighter.
14. **Transfer rates**: Proportion of first-time degree-seeking students enrolling at CCC who subsequently transfer to 4-year college programs in Arizona.

**Baseline:**
30% of **transfer intent** first-time students entering CCC in 2002-03 transferred to an Arizona university within 5 years,
40% of **transfer behavior** first-time students entering CCC in 2002-03 transferred to an Arizona university within five years

21% of **transfer intent** first time students entering all Arizona community colleges in 2002-03 transferred to an Arizona university within 5 years,
24% of **transfer behavior** first-time students entering all Arizona community colleges transferred to an Arizona university within 5 years

**1st Year Update:**
27% of **transfer intent** first-time students entering CCC in 2003-04 transferred to an Arizona university within 5 years,
25% of **transfer behavior** first-time students entering CCC in 2003-04 transferred to an Arizona university within five years

21% of **transfer intent** first time students entering all Arizona community colleges in 2003-04 transferred to an Arizona university within 5 years,
25% of **transfer behavior** first-time students entering all Arizona community colleges in 2003-04 transferred to an Arizona university within 5 years

**Measure:** First-time students entering higher education at a community college who declare an intent to transfer or enroll in transfer bearing courses that are found enrolled at an Arizona university within a five year time period after entry. Rates determined by records contained on Arizona State System for Information on Student Transfer (ASSIST).

**Value:** Respect

15. **Valuing Employees & Promoting a Learning Environment**: 1) Extent that employees indicate they feel valued, 2) Extent that employees report they embody CCC core values, 3) Extent that employees report that CCC is supportive of innovation and change, 4) Number of annual assessment based curricular changes and program improvements made to the learning environment.

**Baselines:**
1) Recognition 51% (2008)
2) CCC Core Values 75% (2008)
3) Innovation and change 25% (2008)
4) 58 changes and improvements made (2007-08)

**1st Year Update:**
1) Recognition 39% (2010)
2) CCC Core Values 67% (2010)
3) Innovation and change 66% (2010)
4) 32 changes and improvements made (2008-09)
Measure: Proportion of employees responding favorability to statements posed on the CCC Employee Satisfaction Survey. The number of curricular changes or program improvements made in the past year as reported on academic department assessment template updates.

Value: Sustainability

16. Sustainability Commitment: Strive to complete all items listed in Coconino Community Colleges Sustainability plan “A” list of proposed sustainable projects. Completion of the items on the “A” list will reduce CCC carbon footprint, decrease operational cost and save natural resources. Continue to work within the sustainable Committee’s mission of Learning, Living and working Sustainable.

Baseline: To complete 90% of all items on the “A” list. The “A” list is established in October with expected completion by November 2011.

Sustainable learning opportunities: Educate faculty, staff, students and residents of Coconino County about the physical, biological, cultural, socio-economic, and ethical dimensions of sustainability.

1) Baseline: Nine credit classes offered directly related to sustainability (2008-09).
   1st Year Update: Nine credit classes and two non-credit classes offered directly related to sustainability (2009-10)
   Measurement: Number of sustainability related credit and non-credit classes District-wide annually as recorded in Banner.
2) Baseline: Two in-house professional development classes have been held for staff on sustainability (2008-09).
3) 1st Year Update: Eight in-house professional development classes have been held for staff on sustainability (2009-10).

Measurement: Number of in-house classes on sustainability for faculty and staff.

17. Sustainable purchasing practices: Coconino Community College will continue to purchase equipment and appliances that have an Energy Star rating that can be purchased within purchasing-procedural guidelines.

Baseline: Continue purchasing Energy Star rated equipment and appliances within purchasing-procedural guidelines. During fiscal year 2009-10, 100 computers were purchased that are Energy Star compliant. That purchase entailed approximately 10% of the computers district-wide.