

**COCONINO COMMUNITY COLLEGE  
DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD**

**REGULAR MEETING**

**NOVEMBER 14, 2018**



**COCONINO COMMUNITY COLLEGE  
MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING  
OF THE  
DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD  
NOVEMBER 14, 2018**

A Regular Meeting of the Coconino Community College District Governing Board was held in the Board Room at the Lone Tree Campus at 2800 S. Lone Tree Road, Flagstaff, Arizona 86005. Board Chair, Ms. Patricia Garcia, called the meeting to order at 5:32 pm.

PRESENT: Patricia Garcia  
Lloyd Hammonds  
Patrick Hurley  
Marie Peoples  
Nat White

ABSENT: None

Also Present: Dr. Colleen Smith, CCC President; Ms. Ali Applin, Kimberly Batty-Herbert, Ms. Sarah Benton, Ms. Stephanie Del Giorgio, Ms. Barb Eickmeyer, Mr. Tom Eickmeyer, Ms. Angela Emerson, Mr. Brian Francis, Mr. Brian Harris, Ms. Susie Garretson, Mr. Doug King, Mr. Lance Lamoreux, Ms. Maya Lanzetta, Ms. Kay Leum, Ms. Robin Long, Ms. Gail Lowe, Ms. Jane Mac Donald, Dr. Michael Merica, Dr. Gonzalo Perez, Mr. Anthony Rivera, Ms. April Sandoval, Mr. Dietrich Sauer, Mr. Bobby Sedillo, Dr. Nate Southerland, Mr. Kurt Stull, Mr. Scott Talboom, Ms. Tara Trujillo, Ms. Jami Van Ess, Mr. Bob Voytek, and Ms. Isabella Zagare.

Reports, summaries, background material and other documents referred to in these minutes can be found in the November 14, 2018 documents file.

**Follow Up**

- Dr. Nat White would like to see a bullet point summary of the ways the CRM software is used and how those uses solve problems for students to give the Board some sense of what changes are made and the effects they will have.

**ADOPTION OF AGENDA**

Mr. Patrick Hurley moved to approve the agenda, and Dr. Marie Peoples seconded the motion. The agenda was approved as presented (Ms. Garcia, Mr. Hammonds, Mr. Hurley, Dr. Peoples, and Dr. White voting in favor).

**ADOPTION OF CONSENT AGENDA**

Minutes of a Work Session – October 17, 2018  
Minutes of a Regular Meeting – October 17, 2018  
Separations/New Hires

Mr. Patrick Hurley moved to approve the Consent Agenda, and Dr. Nat White seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved (Ms. Garcia, Mr. Hammonds, Mr. Hurley, Dr. Peoples, and Dr. White voting in favor).

### **FOLLOW UP ITEMS**

Ms. Patricia Garcia reviewed the follow-up items with the Board. Follow up items are in progress or on the agenda for today's meeting.

### **INTRODUCTION OF GUESTS**

Mr. Brian Harris introduced the following guests:

- Mr. Lance Lamoreux, CCC2NAU student
- Ms. Stephanie Del Giorgio NAU student
- Ms. Barb and Mr. Tom Eickmeyer, Mrs. Eickmeyer was the former chair of the CCC Languages Department
- Ms. Jane MacDonald, former Director for the Arizona Schools for the Deaf and Blind
- Ms. Gail Lowe and Ms. Susie Garrettson, members of Supporters for a Thriving CCC
- Ms. Angela Emerson and Ms. Tara Trujillo, American Sign Language interpreters

### **CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Ms. Barb Eickmeyer responded to the call to the public. Ms. Eickmeyer is a former College faculty member. She was also part of the creation for the American Sign Language (ASL) interpreter program at the College. She is saddened to hear that the program is on the chopping block and wanted to highlight the twenty graduates of the program who went out and began careers as interpreters. Ms. Eickmeyer also talked about Ms. Jane McDonald and her experience in having to travel to Phoenix to complete an ASL Interpreter program. Ms. McDonald is one success story, and Ms. Eickmeyer believes there are twenty more. When the program was formed, one of the goals was to partner with NAU to offer a transfer program. Ms. Eickmeyer asked if this partnership occurred.

Ms. Jane MacDonald thanked the Board members for an opportunity to talk to the Board. She previously worked for the Arizona Schools for the Deaf and Blind in Flagstaff as the regional director. Part of that role was to serve deaf children in the classroom. Many deaf students are born to hearing adults, and the school relies on the College's sign language interpreters to provide services to students. What she wants to be so clear about tonight is that not all interpreters are created equally, and not all programs are equal. Sarah Benton brought the experience and perspective to allow students to bridge the gap between deaf and hearing culture. CCC has been a vanguard, and the ASL interpreter program is so different than most of the programs she has encountered. Ms. MacDonald would like the College to consider that not only are we graduating students who have the opportunity to work in the field, they have a great deal to do with the success of a deaf child in a hearing classroom. This program provided people the opportunity to go out into the world and be successful and impact the lives of deaf children.

Ms. Gail Lowe expressed her sadness that the community decided not to support a very modest ask, but also sees this as an opportunity to move forward with partnerships with people that do choose to support the College. When Ms. Lowe and other community members started CCC Champions a year ago, they made a long-term commitment to support CCC, learn about what the

College is doing in the community, and take that information to fellow community members. Ms. Lowe encourages others to join CCC Champions as they meet on the last Thursday of each month. Supporters for a Thriving CCC will also continue and be ready if there is a need for a political action committee in the future.

Ms. Susie Garrettson is also a member of Supporters for a Thriving CCC and stated that she has worked on a few campaigns over the years and has never worked so hard on a campaign. The political action committee members worked so hard, got out to so many places, were able to get resolutions of support from the Navajo Chapters, and talked to people in rural areas. The members of Supporters for a Thriving CCC are in this for the long haul and will be here to support the College.

On behalf of the Board, Ms. Garcia thanked everyone who worked so hard to educate the public and give information to help community members make an informed decision when they voted. The Board truly appreciates the College's support and the support of the many people who worked on behalf of the College in the community.

### **ACTION ITEMS**

#### **President's Contract and Compensation** – Ms. Patricia Garcia

Ms. Garcia recommended that the board approve Addendum 3 to the President's contract and authorize the Board Chair to sign Addendum 3 to the President's contract.

Dr. Nat White made a motion to accept the recommendation. The motion was seconded by Dr. Marie Peoples and unanimously approved (Ms. Garcia, Mr. Hammonds, Mr. Hurley, Dr. Peoples, and Dr. White voting in favor).

Ms. Garcia further recommended that based on Addendum 2 (dated September 20, 2017) to the President's Contract; the Board approve a 2% pay increase for the President, retroactive to July 1, 2018. This recommendation is consistent with the raises that other employees received this year.

Mr. Patrick Hurley made a motion to accept the recommendation. Dr. Marie Peoples seconded the motion, and it was unanimously approved (Ms. Garcia, Mr. Hammonds, Mr. Hurley, Dr. Peoples, and Dr. White voting in favor).

#### **DGB Goals and Priorities** – Ms. Patricia Garcia

The Board asked to review the action item that included suggestions made by Lloyd Hammonds for the Board Goals and Priorities and has discussed these items at length.

Mr. Nat White moved to accept Mr. Hammonds version of the Board Goals and Priorities for 2018-2019. Mr. Patrick Hurley seconded the motion, and it was unanimously approved (Ms. Garcia, Mr. Hammonds, Mr. Hurley, Dr. Peoples, and Dr. White voting in favor).

#### **President and Administration Goals** – Ms. Patricia Garcia

Dr. Colleen Smith talked about the changes made to this action item over the break that was based on the Board's discussion during tonight's Work Session. Dr. Smith presented the Board presented

with a written action item including these changes and offered to take additional time to revise these items if Board would like.

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds suggested that the Board move forward with the action item and made a motion to President and Administration Goals. Mr. Patrick Hurley seconded the motion. Discussion on the motion included the following points:

- Whether item 5 c (related to the ballot initiative/override) should be included at this point. Some board members argued to keep this item, Dr. White thought there should be something else in this area.
- Dr. White suggested adding item 5 e to read: Develop mutually beneficial relationships with schools, businesses, and other organizations throughout the County. Dr. White wanted to include an item that did not focus on statewide advocacy.
- The Board discussed adopting these goals at this time. Because the Board was late in adopting them this year, they will consider these goals active as of July 1, 2018.
- Dr. White felt that having the opportunity for more time makes these goals more relevant.
- Ms. Garcia suggested adding the word “continue” to the start of item 5 e.

Mr. Hammonds changed his motion to include Dr. White’s suggestions and the materials Dr. Smith included based on the earlier Board conversation. Mr. Patrick Hurley seconded the motion, and it was unanimously approved (Ms. Garcia, Mr. Hammonds, Mr. Hurley, Dr. Peoples, and Dr. White voting in favor).

**Diversity Statement** – Mr. Dietrich Sauer

Mr. Dietrich Sauer thanked the board for reconsidering this agenda item. He asked the Board to approve the Diversity Statement and was available to answer any questions. Mr. Hurley asked that the Diversity Statement be read into the record. The statement is as follows:

“Coconino Community College recognizes and respects diversity and the value it brings to our communities. We appreciate and welcome cultures, identities, beliefs, experiences and all that makes us unique. CCC champions and takes action to build an inclusive working and learning environment. We are allies and advocates, navigating respectful dialogue about our shared humanity.”

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds made a motion to adopt the Diversity Statement. Dr. Marie Peoples seconded the motion.

Dr. Peoples and Ms. Garcia expressed their appreciation for the Diversity Statement. Mr. Hammonds thanked the Diversity Committee for development of the statement and the thoughtful review process. He felt this was one of the best diversity statements he has seen at an educational institution.

The motion was unanimously approved (Ms. Garcia, Mr. Hammonds, Mr. Hurley, Dr. Peoples, and Dr. White voting in favor).

**Intergovernmental Agreement – Small Business Development Center (SBDC) and Coconino County** – Mr. Ron Hurle

Dr. Marie People recused herself for this action item and left the room briefly.

Mr. Robert Sedillo presented this intergovernmental agreement between the College and Coconino County to offer Basic Business Empowerment classes.

The County, through its Community Services Department, operates the Basic Business Empowerment (BBE) program, a unique microbusiness development training program that serves as an important tool for low and moderate-income individuals residing in Coconino County to develop a viable business plan for successful small business start-up and expansion. Operating the BBE program increases the likelihood that participants will be able to leverage assets for their future and future generations, substantially benefitting their quality of life and community.

Coconino Community College operates the Coconino Small Business Development Center (SBDC). The SBDC possesses the small business expertise and is familiar with Coconino County's BBE curriculum. This experience puts the SBDC in a unique position to be able to facilitate BBE courses.

Legal counsel has reviewed the IGA and approved it as to form.

Mr. Sedillo recommended that the Board approve the Coconino County Basic Business Empowerment IGA and addenda and authorize the President to sign the agreement on behalf of the College.

Mr. Patrick Hurley made a motion to approve the intergovernmental agreement as presented. Dr. Nat White seconded the motion.

Dr. White mentioned that this was an entirely appropriate and efficient collaboration. He asked what the definition of low and moderate income was. Mr. Sedillo will find out and send the information to the Board. Dr. White also asked where the funding for these programs originates. The County receives federal funds for these programs.

The motion carried with one abstention (Ms. Garcia, Mr. Hammonds, Mr. Hurley, and Dr. White voting in favor, Dr. Peoples abstaining).

**Economic Collaborative of Northern Arizona (ECoNA) Lease** – Ms. Jami Van Ess

Ms. Jami Van Ess presented a lease agreement for ECoNA to use office space at the Lone Tree Campus. This agreement came about because of Dr. Smith's involvement with ECoNA on their Executive Board and conversations with ECoNA Executive Director, Mr. John Stigmon. These discussions identified the College as a good option for ECoNA office space and Room 600 on the Lone Tree Campus as a possible lease location. Ms. Van Ess and Mr. Stigmon have worked through the details for costs, and the lease includes options for renewals. The lease also consists of the College's standard lease terms.

Ms. Van Ess recommended that the District Governing Board adopt a motion approving the first year of the ECoNA lease agreement and authorize the President to sign the document.

Dr. Colleen Smith mentioned that having ECoNA on campus will bring business, industry, and those working in economic development to the College.

Mr. Hurley asked what this lease does to the College's financial commitment to ECoNA. The lease amount more than covers that commitment, resulting in the College not having a financial contribution to ECoNA.

Mr. Patrick Hurley moved to approve the lease agreement as presented. Mr. Lloyd Hammonds seconded the motion, and it was unanimously approved (Ms. Garcia, Mr. Hammonds, Mr. Hurley, Dr. Peoples, and Dr. White voting in favor).

**Customer Relationship Management Solution (CRM)/Enrollment RX Contract** –Dr. Nate Southerland, Ms. Jami Van Ess, and Mr. Ron Hurle

Ms. Jami Van Ess presented this agenda item as the culmination of work the College has been doing for the past two years. The College has reviewed input from surveys and feedback from departments to learn that communication with students needed to be improved. Implementing a CRM software was also discussed as a way to correct some of the deficiencies identified as part of the Business Process Review conducted two years ago.

This contract piggybacks on state contracts that give the College a discounted rate for this software. The College also conducted a previous RFP process for this type of software that was unsuccessful. The College also conducted reference checks for the company that was very positive.

There are two parts to the contract. The first is the foundational software of Salesforce which is best in class software among higher education and most industries. The second part is the Enrollment RX software that overlays Salesforce and is specifically geared towards higher education.

The quotes for pricing include implementation fees and five years of services. Funds for the software would come out of STEM Funding. The statutes related to STEM funding allow for this kind of purchase.

It is Ms. Van Ess, Dr. Southerland, and Mr. Hurle's recommendation that the District Governing Board adopt a motion to approve the award for \$368,500 to Enrollment RX and Salesforce and to authorize the president to sign a Five (5) year agreement.

Dr. Colleen Smith asked the Board to consider that she is usually reluctant to spend funds like this. However, the use of STEM funds does not take funds away from other areas of the College, and use of this type of funding fits the definitions for STEM funding. Implementation of these software systems will also be the culmination of two years of work and will provide solutions for many of

the issues identified in the Business Process Review as well as negative student feedback. This solution is something that will work with all areas of the College to help with communication, pathways, and assisting students to be successful.

Dr. White feels that implementing this software is going in the right direction and he feels comfortable with it. He would like to see a bullet point summary of the ways the software is used and how those uses solve problems for students to give the Board some sense of what changes are made and the effects they will have.

Ms. Garcia stated a concern that this item didn't seem to apply to STEM and this purchase was using a large amount of STEM funding that could be applied to other activities. The administrative team talked through all of this year's STEM funding requests, and this item was identified as the number one priority because it would impact students and communication in so many ways. The College chose STEM funding for this item as the statutory language is written very broadly to allow for technology like this. The statute language also includes things that improve service to students and technology that will improve service. Funding this software does not use all of the STEM funding each year so the College will still be able to use the remaining funds for other priorities. Because of the financial austerity program over the past eight years, there was a backlog of equipment requests that the College needed to address. At this time, these requests have been resolved and the College can move forward with addressing other needs.

Dr. Nat White made a motion to accept the recommendation. The motion was seconded by Dr. Marie Peoples and unanimously approved (Ms. Garcia, Mr. Hammonds, Mr. Hurley, Dr. Peoples, and Dr. White voting in favor).

### **Discontinuation of the American Sign Language (ASL) Interpreting Certificate and Degree**

– Dr. Nate Southerland

Dr. Kimberly Batty-Herbert requested to discontinue the American Sign Language (ASL) Interpreting Certificate and Degree Program. The recommendation to sunset the program has been under consideration for a very long time, and Academic Affairs does not make this recommendation lightly. This program has only been able to reach a maximum of six students with a current class of four. The program graduated eighteen students who have gone on to do great things, eleven of whom work in this community and eight who went on to receive advanced degrees. This program has had a significant impact on the community.

Dr. Batty-Herbert stated that the basic ASL language proficiency courses will still be offered and would be taught and supervised by Ms. Sarah Benton. There are high school and NAU students that come to the College specifically for these courses. Dr. Batty-Herbert thanked Ms. Benton for her dedication to this program. Students currently in the program would be able to finish it before it is discontinued.



Other factors that were considered when making this recommendation were that a baccalaureate degree is now required for students to sit for the national certification exam, the lack of opportunities for students for sign language immersion, and the difficulties in recruiting and retaining qualified faculty.

Given those concerns, it remains the recommendation of Academic Affairs that the American Sign Language (ASL) Interpreting and Certificate and Degree programs be discontinued at the end of the Spring 2019 semester and that new enrollment for the program is suspended immediately.

Mr. Patrick Hurley asked what the portion of the program being eliminated cost above other language programs. The primary costs for the program are faculty and adjunct faculty, and if the program is eliminated, Ms. Benton will transition from teaching the interpreter program classes to general sign language proficiency programs. These changes would reduce the costs for part-time faculty. Mr. Hurley participated in the process of discontinuing early childhood education and other programs and has asked that the College evaluate programs and make decisions like this. However, he feels that the Board should also consider factors like where the students have to go to complete their degree (currently the University of Arizona as NAU does not offer this program). Mr. Hurley asked if the College could create a program that steps into the University of Arizona program. Ms. Benton stated that the College has a two + two agreement with the University of Arizona. Mr. Hurley also felt that the College needed to keep unique programs that put the College on the map.

Dr. Nate Southerland worked with Ms. Sarah Benton, and this recommendation was generated by the program review process. Dr. Smith brought this recommendation forward to the Board because she felt that due diligence had been done in gathering information and proposing to end the program.

Dr. Southerland received good feedback about this change from the American Sign Language advisory committee. Since students have to take the current ASL proficiency classes before they can enter the interpreter program, the College will still offer those classes and then help students move on to baccalaureate degree programs to create a pathway for students to complete their degrees. Academic Affairs has also reached out to NAU, and due to the small number of students in the College's programs, NAU has not expressed a desire to build a baccalaureate program. The University of Arizona has also shown a preference for students to attend school in Tucson to provide an immersive experience in the deaf community.

Dr. Marie Peoples followed up on Mr. Hurley's comments and would like to consider more data than just the enrollment numbers for the program. As future programs are recommended for discontinuation, she would appreciate seeing financial information as well. Dr. Peoples also asked what the threshold is in determining the success of a program. For programs like this, the College tries to work with smaller enrollment numbers, especially when students need a class to graduate.

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds cannot support the recommendation to eliminate this program at this time. His objection is based primarily on the process used in bringing this item to the Board. The Board

is being asked to eliminate the program but has less information than those proposing this change. Mr. Hammonds needs to know more about the financial impact of discontinuing the program and if there are other alternatives. He would like to review the program review documents before making a decision and also thinks that this is something that the Board should give extended time to review agenda items like this instead of presenting the recommendation to discontinue the program at today's meeting and voting to discontinue the program at the same meeting.

Ms. Garcia echoed some of the Board's comments that the College cannot expect large enrollment in this program. She did hear powerful comments tonight that this program has a significant impact on the community. The Board also needs to be clear that some of our students may not even have the means to attend a university like the University of Arizona to complete the program.

Mr. Patrick Hurley moved to postpone this item to another, unspecified meeting after the Board has received more information. Dr. Marie Peoples seconded the motion.

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds did not feel that there needed to be a motion and that this issue could die for lack of a motion. He would vote against the motion, allow it not to pass, and request that if the administration wants to come back with a proposal with complete information, which may be the better route.

Mr. Hurley withdrew the motion, and Dr. Peoples removed her second.

Ms. Garcia thanked everyone who worked to bring information forward tonight and the discussions that were thoughtful and well considered over time. The Board's discussion tonight does not discount this work.

#### **Distinguished Service Award – Mr. Scott Talboom**

Mr. Scott Talboom highlighted the process for nominating a Distinguished Service Award winner and based on the results of that process, recommended Mr. Steve Peru for the award this year. Mr. Talboom spoke of Mr. Peru's work in the community, his experience attending a community college, and his work championing the College in the community.

Mr. Talboom recommended that the Board approve Mr. Steve Peru as the 2018 Distinguished Service Award Recipient.

Dr. Nat White made a motion to accept the motion. Mr. Patrick Hurley seconded the motion.

The motion was unanimously approved (Ms. Garcia, Mr. Hammonds, Mr. Hurley, Dr. Peoples, and Dr. White voting in favor).

Dr. White asked how Mr. Peru would be notified. Mr. Talboom recommended that a board member make the notification which is one of the ways awardees have been told in the past. Dr. White, Mr. Hurley, and Ms. Garcia all volunteered to make the announcement. Ms. Garcia will do so as chair of the Board.

### **2019 DGB Meeting Schedule – Ms. April Sandoval**

Ms. April Sandoval reviewed the proposed schedule and how it was developed. Dr. Colleen Smith talked about the Spring 2019 Round Table and its focus on stating the mission, vision, core values review process as part of building the next strategic plan.

Ms. Garcia mentioned that the Board could and will make changes to the schedule as needed.

Mr. Patrick Hurley made a motion to approve the 2019 DGB meeting schedule. Dr. Marie Peoples seconded the motion.

Ms. April Sandoval will send a copy of the schedule to Board members.

Ms. Garcia encouraged the Board to look forward on their schedule for the August Retreat to ensure these dates will work.

The motion was unanimously approved (Ms. Garcia, Mr. Hammonds, Mr. Hurley, Dr. Peoples, and Dr. White voting in favor).

### **INFORMATION REPORTS**

#### **District Governing Board**

Dr. Nat White updated the Board on the Foundation Board meeting held yesterday at the Fourth Street Innovation Center. The meeting included a tour of the CIS classroom and simulation lab as well as a presentation by EMS faculty member Dave Manning.

The Alliance will meet again on Friday and is working on revamping the goals and purpose of the Alliance.

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds does not have a detailed report from AACCT. The group will meet on December 7<sup>th</sup> to review the discussions held at the ACCT Leadership Congress, especially those at the Arizona trustee breakfast.

#### **Business and Administrative Services**– Ms. Jami Van Ess

Ms. Jami Van Ess reviewed the Fall 2018 full-time student equivalent (FTSE) report. For additional details on the report, please see the November 14, 2018 documents file.

#### **President’s Report** - Dr. Colleen Smith

Dr. Smith highlighted some of the many amazing things being done by faculty and staff at the College with very little funding and thanked everyone for all the work we do. She is so excited to keep hearing about collaborations and how people are working together.

Ms. Patricia Garcia pointed out the diminishing rate for student loan defaults and how important that is in making our students succeed at school and in their life. She thanked Mr. Bob Voytek and everyone who worked to make the College’s default rate so low.

Dr. Colleen Smith asked the Board to review the standing agenda items. Please let her know if Board members would like to add anything or move something to a different meeting.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

The next District Governing Board meeting will be January 16, 2019 (Regular Meeting) and January 30, 2019 (Budget Retreat)

The next Foundation Board meeting will be TBD (January 2019).

**MEETING EVALUATION**

The Board appreciated the discussion and participation for the American Sign Language agenda item.

ADJOURNMENT: Mr. Patrick Hurley made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 7:30 pm. The motion was seconded by Dr. Marie Peoples and was unanimously approved (Ms. Garcia, Mr. Hammonds, Mr. Hurley, Dr. Peoples, and Dr. White voting in favor).

**MINUTES PREPARED BY:**

---

Ms. April Sandoval  
Board Recorder

---

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds  
Vice Chair/Secretary of the Board

---

Ms. Patricia Garcia  
Board Chair