

**COCONINO COMMUNITY COLLEGE  
DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD**

**REGULAR MEETING**

**MARCH 22, 2017**



**COCONINO COMMUNITY COLLEGE  
MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING  
OF THE  
DISTRICT GOVERNING BOARD  
MARCH 22, 2017**

A Regular Meeting of the Coconino Community College District Governing Board was held in the Board Room at the Lone Tree Campus at 2800 S. Lone Tree Road, Flagstaff, Arizona 86005. Board Chair, Ms. Patricia Garcia, called the meeting to order at 5:30 pm.

**PRESENT:** Patricia Garcia  
Lloyd Hammonds  
Patrick Hurley  
Marie Peoples  
Nat White

**ABSENT:** None

Also Present: Dr. Colleen Smith, CCC President; Dr. Monica Baker, Mr. Dan Begay, Ms. Colleen Carscallen, Dr. Dudley Gardner, Ms. Kimmi Grulke, Mr. Brian Harris, Mr. Larry Hendricks, Ms. Veronica Hipolito, Mr. Jeff Jones, Dr. Andrew Lawlor, Dr. Michael Merica, Ms. Siri Mullaney, Ms. Suzzanna Rodriguez, Ms. April Sandoval, Mr. Dietrich Sauer, Mr. Kurt Stull, Mr. Scott Talboom, Ms. Mary Talentinow, Ms. Jami Van Ess, and Mr. Bob Voytek.

Reports, summaries, background material and other documents referred to in these minutes can be found in the March 22, 2017 documents file.

Follow Up
• None

Important Dates	
April 26, 2017	DGB Meeting
April 28, 2017	Palette to Palate

**ADOPTION OF AGENDA**

Mr. Patrick Hurley moved to approve the agenda and Dr. Marie Peoples seconded the motion. The agenda was approved as presented.

**ADOPTION OF CONSENT AGENDA**

Minutes of a Special Meeting February 13, 2017  
Minutes of the Work Session, February 22, 2017  
Minutes of the Regular Meeting, February 22, 2017  
Separations/New Hires  
Full Time Faculty Contract Renewals for 2017-2018

Mr. Patrick Hurley moved to approve the Consent Agenda and Mr. Lloyd Hammonds seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

### **FOLLOW UP ITEMS**

Ms. Patricia Garcia reviewed the follow up items with the Board.

### **INTRODUCTION OF GUESTS**

Guests in attendance included Mr. Mark Easton, Ms. Tara Bubbico, and Ms. Katherine Radics.

### **CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

There was no response to the call to the public.

### **CCC EXCELLENCE/STUDENT SUCCESS – Phi Theta Kappa All Arizona Academic Team Members – Tara Bubbico and Katherine Radics – Ms. Veronica Hipolito**

Ms. Veronica Hipolito introduced the two student representatives for the All Arizona Academic Team this year. The Board congratulated the students on their achievement.

### **RECOGNITION FOR MR. MARK EASTON – Ms. Jami Van Ess**

Ms. Jami Van Ess and Ms. Patricia Garcia presented Mr. Mark Easton with a commemorative plaque honoring his service to the College. The plaque recognized Mark, his years of service, and his role in building the College's physical facilities throughout the county.

Ms. Garcia expressed appreciation for all the work done by Mr. Easton on behalf of the College. Mr. Hammonds congratulated Mr. Easton and thanked him for all the years of service for the district and in particular for his work for the Page Instructional Site.

### **ACTION ITEMS**

#### **Salary and Benefits -** Ms. Jami Van Ess and Mr. Dietrich Sauer

Based on the Board's feedback from the Work Session, Ms. Jami Van Ess presented two new options for salaries and benefits. Option C and D both increased the amount available for market adjustments to salaries with Option C bringing employees within 1% of market and Option D bringing employees to market salary levels.

Dr. Nat White was supportive of Option D and at least trying to meet market salaries. Even with this increase, the College will still be tenth out of ten community colleges in the state because of the cost of living differential. Dr. White asked the Board to consider that revenue the College puts into staff also benefits the local community. Dr. White mentioned that it is important to staff for the Board to recognize that faculty and staff are doing more than ever as a result of the financial austerity plan.

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds concurs with Dr. White's comments and stated that approving Option D makes an important statement to the faculty and staff about the value the Board places on employees. There is a significant expense to the College when it is not competitive to the market. The College is a very personnel dependent business and needs to make sure that it can attract the highest quality employees possible. Mr. Hammonds feels that Option D moves the College in that direction.

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds made a motion to adopt Option D. Dr. Nat White seconded the motion.

Discussion on the motion focused on the difficulty in approving the dollar amounts in Option C or D because the messages the College is sending to the community. Dr. Marie Peoples does support the comments on the value to employees but has to balance that with community perception. Dr. Peoples is supportive of Option A or B.

Mr. Patrick Hurley has expressed objections to raising salaries to meet market levels in past years. Instead, he would prefer that the College give fair compensation for the work being done. Mr. Hurley would support Option C or D on a one-time basis to see what these adjustments do for faculty and staff. Mr. Hurley is struggling with community perception but reminded the Board that in his time on the Board, the Board has always tried to find money to fairly compensate faculty and staff.

Dr. Nat White does not see the market average as a great goal to reach because it is not fair compensation when the cost of living is factored in. Dr. White asked the Board to consider this request from the point of view of the available revenue and the value the College places on its employees. Dr. White is still supportive of Option D.

Ms. Patricia Garcia would like to see faculty and staff compensated reasonably and fairly. Ms. Garcia weighs this decision against the fact that we are asking students to shoulder more of the financial burden. Ms. Garcia is supportive of Option B.

Mr. Hurley would support either Option C or Option D.

Dr. Peoples supports all of the comments made during this meeting but is considering comments she has heard from the community. Dr. Peoples supports Option A or B and would prefer to consider additional increases in the future.

Chair Garcia called the question. Dr. Nat White and Mr. Lloyd Hammonds voted yes on the motion. Ms. Patricia Garcia, Dr. Marie Peoples, and Mr. Patrick Hurley voted no. The motion to adopt Option D failed.

Mr. Patrick Hurley made a motion to adopt Option C which puts the College close to market salary levels. Mr. Lloyd Hammonds seconded the motion.

Dr. Nat White, Mr. Patrick Hurley, and Mr. Lloyd Hammonds voted yes on the motion. Ms. Patricia Garcia and Dr. Marie Peoples voted no. The motion to adopt Option C carried.

Dr. Smith thanked the Board for making a difficult decision and for their support of putting employees first within the College's budget constraints. Dr. Smith thanked the staff for the work that went into this proposal and in the budget development process used this year.

Mr. Patrick Hurley left the meeting but a quorum was maintained which allowed the meeting to continue.

**Educational Attainment Achievement** - Mr. Dietrich Sauer

Mr. Dietrich Sauer shared the great news that the College has two employees who have invested their own time and energy in moving forward with attaining additional education and who have attained degrees above the requirements for their positions.

Dr. Nat White moved to approve the Educational Attainment Achievement as submitted and to allow Human Resources to process the pay adjustments for the employees. Dr. Marie Peoples seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved.

The Board congratulated Ms. Jessica Real and Ms. Linda Barker.

**Policy 141-00 Website** - Mr. Scott Talboom

Mr. Scott Talboom reviewed the action item related to updates to the Policy 141-00. The IT and Institutional Advancement Departments have been working on updating the College's website and through that process, also suggested updates to the policy and procedure for the website. The College is planning on launching the new website on May 20, 2017. The significant change to the policy is that the website would be jointly administered by IT and Institutional Advancement.

Mr. Scott Talboom recommended that the Board approve the changes to Policy 141-00 Website.

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds suggesting adding the word "accurate" somewhere in the policy. The Board suggested that this be added as follows: "and accurately informing internal and external...".

Dr. Nat White made a motion to accept the changes to Policy 141-00 with the addition of the word accurately. Dr. Marie Peoples seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved.

**Policy 142-00 Copyright Compliance** - Dr. Dudley Gardner

Dr. Dudley Gardner presented the proposed changes to Policy 142-00 and the efforts that were made to develop the changes to the policy. These changes were suggested to encourage excellency and consistency in copyright compliance.

Dr. Gardner recommended that the District Governing Board approve the changes to Policy 142-00 Copyright Law Compliance.

Dr. Nat White moved that the District Governing Board approve the changes to Policy 142-00 Copyright Law Compliance. Dr. Marie Peoples seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved.

**Policy 305-00 Intellectual Property** – Dr. Dudley Gardner

Dr. Dudley Gardner reviewed the suggested changes to Policy 305-00 and why the changes were necessary. These changes were made to better define who owns intellectual property.

Dr. Nat White appreciated the work put into this effort and to ensuring that the College is up to date.

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds wanted to commend College Council for their work in reviewing and approving the procedures and helping make sure that shared governance is working.

Dr. Marie Peoples moved to adopt the changes to Policy 305-00 Intellectual Property. Dr. Nat White seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved.

## **INFORMATION REPORTS**

### **Board Reports**

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds reported to the Board on the March 9, 2017 AADGB Meeting. The composition of AADGB has changed dramatically and six new members have joined. The next Governance Institute for Student Success (GISS) event is being planned for the end of October or November. Mr. Lloyd Hammonds is suggesting that GISS include an opportunity for Board Members to participate in the Governance Leadership Institute (GLI).

Dr. Nat White and Mr. Scott Talboom gave a Foundation Update. The Foundation just learned about a sponsorship for the Annual Meeting and Scholarship Awards. CampusWorks has stepped forward as a presenting sponsor.

### **Academic Affairs** - Dr. Dudley Gardner

Dr. Dudley Gardner updated the Board on the team that will be attending the Higher Learning Commission Conference in April. Academic Affairs is also evaluating all on-line classes and from that evaluation, will develop a class template that the College can use for online learning. Academic Affairs has begun evaluating all part-time faculty members.

### **Business Administrative Services** – Ms. Jami Van Ess

#### **Budget Status Report**

Ms. Jami Van Ess reviewed the Budget Status Report. For additional details on the report, please see the March 22, 2017 documents file.

Ms. Van Ess and the Board discussed material included in the report and ways to make that report more useful to Board members.

### **President's Information Report** Dr. Colleen Smith

Dr. Colleen Smith invited the Board to attend the April 7, 2017 Employee Development Day and highlighted many of the wonderful efforts that happened in the College in February.

## **ANNOUNCEMENTS AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

The next District Governing Board meeting will be April 26, 2017.

The next Foundation Board meeting will be April 11, 2017.

ADJOURNMENT: Dr. Nat White made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 7:10 pm. The motion was seconded by Mr. Lloyd Hammonds and unanimously approved.

**MINUTES PREPARED BY:**

---

Ms. April Sandoval  
Board Recorder

---

Mr. Lloyd Hammonds  
Vice Chair/Secretary of the Board

---

Ms. Patricia Garcia  
Board Chair